**Direction**. Choose a research article to review. Write a five-page (reference list not included in the page count) critique of your chosen paper following the provided structure below. You may cite additional literature and studies to support your critique and conclusions. Please use Times New Roman font, size 12, and double spacing. Ensure that your in-text citations and reference list adhere to the APA 7th Edition format.

| | |
|---|---|
| Student name: | **Quarteros, Evelyn V.** |
| Student number: | **202522050** |
| Date submitted: | **May 21, 2026** |
| Research title: | **The Role of ICT in English Language and Pedagogy** |
| Author/s: | **Aminatu Garba (2025)** |
| Link to the article: | **https://tinyurl.com/4nhse5ep** |

# A Critique of Garba (2025): The Role of ICT in English Language and Pedagogy

## I. Introduction

The integration of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) has fundamentally reshaped English Language Teaching (ELT), creating both opportunities for language acquisition and complex structural hurdles for educators. Navigating this shift requires an evidence-based exploration of how digital tools intersect with core pedagogical domains. This paper critiques Aminatu Garba's (2025) study, "The Role of ICT in English Language and Pedagogy," which offers a comprehensive investigation into this phenomenon. Garba employs a rigorous mixed-methods approach, synthesizing a macro-level quantitative bibliometric analysis (1,677 articles) with micro-level qualitative case studies and empirical surveys situated in Nigeria. The study reveals that while digital resources significantly accelerate language proficiency—demonstrating strong effect sizes in vocabulary ($d=0.85$) and speaking ($d=0.72$)—these benefits are severely impeded by persistent digital divides. Specifically, findings cite major deficits in internet infrastructure (68%), power stability (80%), and teacher digital literacy (55%) in resource-limited environments. Ultimately, grounded in the Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK) framework, the research advocates for resilient blended learning models and systematic policy reforms to optimize ICT’s potential without compromising pedagogical integrity (Garba, 2025).

The target study, “The Role of ICT in English Language and Pedagogy” by Aminatu Garba (2025), published in the *Nigeria Journal for Technical Education*, comprehensively investigates the multi-faceted role of technology in English language instruction, focusing on linguistic benefits and implementation challenges. To establish empirical depth, the paper uses a rigorous mixed-methods research design. This framework uniquely combines a macro-level quantitative bibliometric analysis of 1,677 articles with micro-level qualitative case studies and empirical surveys situated in Nigeria. This approach allows the study to bridge a global academic dataset with localized fieldwork, synthesizing broad technological trends with the practical realities of a developing nation.

## II. Critique

Aminatu Garba’s (2025) article is highly relevant, addressing the structural intersection of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) and English Language Teaching (ELT). The paper effectively establishes a context by tracing the evolution of Computer-Assisted and Mobile-Assisted Language Learning (CALL/MALL). Conceptually, the work is elevated by its explicit reliance on the Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK) framework (Mishra and Koehler, 2006). TPACK is correctly utilized to analyze the necessary interplay between an instructor’s technological, pedagogical, and content mastery (TK, PK, CK), ensuring that digital tools are systematically mapped to coherent language methodologies rather than being presented in a simplistic, tool-centric manner.

The methodology employs a rigorous, mixed-methods research design to systematically analyze the efficacy of digital tools and diagnose structural barriers to equitable technology execution. The quantitative architecture blends a macro-level bibliometric analysis of 1,677 Scopus-indexed papers spanning 2010 to 2024 with a micro-level meta-analysis. This global data is triangulated with localized qualitative insights: systematic thematic analysis of 30 papers, semi-structured interviews with 15 Nigerian educators, and surveys distributed to 100 language students. This deliberate multi-method approach is a methodological asset, ensuring statistical trends are balanced against the practical realities of variable classroom contexts.

The analytical architecture is of high professional caliber, transparently presenting statistical metrics and thematic clusters. The empirical findings present a compelling, double-sided narrative. The meta-analysis confirms an extraordinary positive impact from ICT tools on acquisition metrics, providing explicit Cohen's d effect sizes for isolated linguistic skills. This finding is heavily supported by recent empirical studies, which similarly show that structured ICT integration yields outstanding proficiency gains across micro-linguistic skills (Tolentino & Santos, 2024).

Despite the high professional caliber, the critique identifies two key flaws: the qualitative interpretation of student surveys feels superficial, and a subtle geographic bias is injected by relying almost entirely on the Scopus database, which omits crucial regional databases. To address these structural disparities, the author proposes actionable, context-sensitive recommendations. Instead of idealistic digital overhauls, the paper

advocates for hybrid blended learning approaches utilizing low-bandwidth or offline mobile operations. Furthermore, it stresses the urgent necessity of enacting localized professional development tracks focusing on practical digital design skills, implementing robust data privacy laws, and ensuring culturally adapted AI platforms. Ultimately, the study concludes that maximizing educational technology requires protecting the foundational integrity of core pedagogy over technological novelty.

## III. Implication of the study

Garba's (2025) study implies that technological innovation must be synchronized with pedagogical frameworks like TPACK and localized infrastructure. By isolating linguistic gains in vocabulary and speaking, the research suggests technology should target specific objectives rather than general engagement. Critically, the reported 68% internet deficit and 80% power instability highlight that high-bandwidth models remain inequitable in developing regions, a reality mirrored by global analyses of rural, resource-constrained schools (Melendez & Rodriguez, 2025; Bakytbekova et al., 2026).

## IV. Application to practice

The practical application of Garba's (2025) findings requires translating the TPACK framework into context-sensitive classroom realities rather than demanding idealized infrastructure. Because the study demonstrates strong linguistic effect sizes in vocabulary ($d$ = 0.85) and speaking ($d$ = 0.72), educators should intentionally prioritize

digital language tools—such as voice-recording software and mobile vocabulary apps—specifically within these two domains. To circumvent the documented 68% internet deficit and 80% power instability, practitioners must design "low-tech," asynchronous blended learning experiences utilizing offline-capable software and pre-downloaded modules. Finally, to address the 55% digital literacy gap, institutions must pivot from generic technology workshops toward specialized professional development tracks that train teachers in practical digital design, allowing them to effectively curate and adapt localized, low-bandwidth language assets.

## V. Conclusion

In conclusion, Aminatu Garba's (2025) study offers a vital, dual-perspective evaluation of ICT integration in language pedagogy, masterfully balancing global empirical data against the stark realities of resource-limited environments. While the paper suffers from minor qualitative superficiality and database geographic bias, its core contribution remains highly significant due to its rigorous mixed-methods architecture and explicit grounding in the TPACK framework. Ultimately, the study serves as a critical reminder that technological innovation cannot replace foundational methodology; rather, optimizing the future of English language teaching requires context-sensitive, "low-tech" blended learning models supported by systemic policy and infrastructure reforms.

**References**

Garba, A. (2025). The role of ICT in English language and pedagogy. *Nigeria Journal for Technical Education*, *32*(1), 45–62.

Kukulska-Hulme, A., & Shield, L. (2008). An overview of mobile assisted language learning: From content delivery to supported collaboration and interaction. *ReCALL*, *20*(3), 271–289. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0958344008000335

Melendez, J., & Rodriguez, M. (2025). Bridging the digital divide: Exploring the use of ICT in English language teaching in rural secondary schools. *Revista de Ciencia y Tecnología de la Universidad de Panamá*, *32*(1), 112–129.

Mishra, P., & Koehler, M. J. (2006). Technological pedagogical content knowledge: A framework for teacher knowledge. *Teachers College Record*, *108*(6), 1017–1054. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9620.2006.00684.x

Stockwell, G. (2012). *Computer-assisted language learning: Diversity in research and practice*. Cambridge University Press.

Tolentino, R., & Santos, M. (2024). Effectiveness of ICT integration in teaching English towards language skills proficiency. *Asian Journal of English Language Teaching*, *14*(2), 45–60.

Warschauer, M. (1996). Computer-assisted language learning: An introduction. In S. Fotos (Ed.), *Multimedia language teaching* (pp. 3–20). Logos International.